

Women's Reservation in Indian Politics: Impact, Issues and Challenges -A Socio Legal Study

Prof. Dr. N. Rajeswari

Faculty of Law, Dr MGR Educational and Research Institute (Deemed to be University),
Chennai-95

Abstract

The inclusion of women in political decision-making is also a key element of democratic governance and social justice. Although the Constitution guarantees equality (Articles 14, 15 and 16), historically women have been under-represented in legislative and political institutions in India. To correct this, different measures have been taken to improve the political representation of women, such as the 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendment, 1992 that reserved seats for women in Panchayat and Urban Local Bodies respectively. These changes greatly bolstered women's representation at the grassroots and ensured new opportunities for women's political participation. This socio-legal study explores the influence of women's reservation in Indian politics before 2021, drawing on the constitutional roots and implications, implementation, successes, and difficulties of the system. The study examines the impact of the reservation policies on the empowerment of women and their leadership and participation in local governance. While it examines the enduring challenges faced by political reservation, including patriarchy, proxy representation, lack of political consciousness, financial dependence and social discrimination. The paper also explores the controversies around the Women's Reservation Bill and the need for the greater participation of women in Parliament and State legislatures. The study finds that although reservation has contributed to the political visibility and participation of women, there is a need for a more general and comprehensive social, educational and institutional reform for achieving substantive equality. The empowerment that can be effected politically can only be realized if there is numerical representation and real decision making power and social change as well.

Keywords

1. Women's Reservation
2. Political Participation
3. Panchayati Raj Institutions
4. Gender Equality
5. Socio-Legal Study

1. Introduction

One of the most significant indicators of democracy and social inclusion is political participation. For democratic nation, the effective involvement of all the sections of the society in the political process is crucial for the representative government and social justice. Women make up almost half of the population of India, but they have hardly made significant inroads into the political sphere. Although the Constitution ensures equality and

non-discrimination, women have encountered many obstacles to political institutions and decision-making processes. Past political exclusion of women has been attributed to social norms, patriarchy, economic dependence, lack of education, and limited access to political networks.

The contribution of women in the freedom movement of India proved their leadership and change makers. Women like Sarojini Naidu, Vijayalakshmi Pandit, Aruna Asaf Ali and Kasturba Gandhi were active in the nationalist movement and played an active role in the struggle for independence. But, following independence, the representation of women in the legislative bodies was not very high. While women had equal political rights, such as suffrage and the right to run for office, structural inequalities persisted that restricted their actual voting and competing in elections.

An issue of political representation for women became more prominent in the last decades of the 20th century as a result of the shift in how the issue of substantive equality was conceptualized, as policymakers and social reformers began to see that formal equality was not sufficient for substantive equality. Women needed institutional support and affirmative actions to be able to overcome the disadvantages in history. The idea of "reservation" therefore came in as a way of having a sufficient representation of women in political institutions. Reservation was not only considered as a welfare measure but as a tool of remedying the systemic discrimination and inclusive governance.

International developments also spurred the need for women's reservation. The countries, as a result of international efforts focusing on women's empowerment and political participation, embraced affirmative action policies. International conferences and conventions emphasized the need to upscale women's participation in public decision making. These changes led to a realisation in India that women's involvement was a prerequisite for democracy to be effective.

Reservation in local selfgovernment institutions was a watershed moment in Indian politics. With the reservation policy, millions of women were able to enter into governance at grassroots level. Women, who were non-participants in the past, were added to the village panchayats as members, chairpersons and decision-makers and also added to municipal bodies. This shift in thinking about women's capabilities and opportunities for leadership development changed the way people thought.

Women have not just been in office, they have been involved in politics. It encompasses participation in policy making, governance, public administration, political campaigns and community decision making processes. Women's effective participation enables them to shape policies on education, health, social services, employment and gender justice. The more that women are represented, the more inclusive the governance and decision-making will be, as diversity of views will be captured in public decision-making.

While there has been some improvement, there are many areas of difficulty. While women continue to suffer discrimination in their political parties, have less access to the resources they need to campaign and are expected to be more interested in home than politics, it is not as though there is no way to change this. Women still suffer discrimination in political parties,

have less access to the resources they need to campaign, and are expected to be more interested in home than politics, but it's not as if there isn't something that can be done about it. For women who have been elected in reserved seats, in many instances, difficulties are faced in exercising independent authority, as a result of the patriarchal influences. All these challenges pose questions about the effectiveness of reservation policies and whether it will bring about a real empowerment.

Thus, a socio-legal analysis of the reservation of women is crucial. This involves an analysis of both the legal framework and the social realities which affect implementation. It assesses if the reservation policies have been successful in changing power dynamics and enhancing women's representation in governance. To grasp the impact of women's reservation, it is crucial to analyse the constitutional changes, legislative efforts, effects, and remaining challenges. This study aims at examining these aspects and evaluating the contribution of reservation for gender equality and democratic participation in India before 2021.

2. Constitutional and Legal Framework for Women's Reservation

The structure of Indian Constitution is the base for women's political participation and reservation policies. The Constitution embodies the values of equality, justice, liberty and dignity, which are at the core of affirmative actions that are aimed at empowering historically disadvantaged groups. These constitutional tenets give the reservation in the politics of women its legitimacy, and the Indian state's doctrine of substantive equality is born from these principles.

All persons are equal before the law and are entitled to equal protection of the law (Article 14(1)). This provision enshrines the basic principle of equality of treatment of women and men before the law. The upholding of equality is guaranteed by Article 15 which bars discrimination based on religion, race, caste, sex and place of birth. Importantly, Article 15(3) gives the State special powers to take special measures for women and children. This provision is the constitutional underpinning of affirmative action policies to counteract gender disadvantages.

Public employment is guaranteed equality of opportunity in Article 16. It is of particular relevance to public services but is in keeping with the wider constitutional principle of equality of opportunity for all citizens. The concept of gender equality is also reiterated in the Directive Principles of State Policy. Article 38 and 39 call on the State to foster social justice and equal opportunities for women and men. These principles have a useful role to play in guiding policies that seek to improve women's role in public life.

The most important change in the laws on women's political reservation was the enactment of the 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments in 1992. The democratic decentralization system was introduced by these amendments with the establishment of Panchayati Raj Institutions and Urban Local Bodies. Article 243D provides for the reservation of at least one-third of all the seats in the Panchayats for women, including women from the SC and ST community. Likewise, the reservation for women in the municipalities is provided under Article 243T.

The provisions of the reservations in these amendments were a revolutionary step in an effort towards political inclusion. This was the first time that millions of women had the right to take an active role in governance. The amendments also allowed for the co-option of chairpersons, which allowed women to lead the local government institutions. Later several states raised the reservation quota, from one-third up to fifty percent, further ensuring better representation of women.

The constitutional changes created a new political world of rural India. Women from a variety of social, economic and cultural backgrounds entered political institutions and learned about governance processes. Legals provided women with the opportunity to be involved in decision-making on local development, education, health, sanitation and welfare programs. It also helped to raise awareness of political rights among women.

Besides constitutional provisions, there are several committees and commissions in place to promote the presence of women in legislative bodies. The Committee on the Status of Women in India highlighted the importance of positive discrimination for the empowerment of women in politics. The structural obstacles to women's effective political participation in elections were pointed out in several reports and were proposed as a remedy for the situation.

The Women's Reservation Bill is an important piece of legislation that proposed to introduce reservation for the women in the Parliament and State Legislative Assemblies of the State. The idea had been to designate one-third of seats as all reserved seats to women in these bodies. The Bill sparked a lot of discussion, found backing from various political parties and women's groups, but was stalled for several years over the implementation and sub-quotas. However, the discussions on the Bill played a major role in raising public awareness about gender disparity in representation.

The legal framework for women's reservation reflects the commitment of India in the direction of inclusive democracy and social justice. It understands that formal equality will not eradicate past inequalities and that positive steps are needed to ensure that people can participate meaningfully. But social acceptance, institutional support and independent authority of the women representatives also play a role in the effectiveness of reservation. Thus, it is necessary to do a socio-legal evaluation of the framework's strengths and weaknesses in advancing substantive political empowerment.

3. Impact of the 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments on Women's Representation

The 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendment was an important event in the history of democratic decentralization and women's political empowerment in India in 1992. Before these changes, women's involvement in governance was limited to voting rights, and women's representation in elected bodies was limited. The purpose of the amendments was to give constitutional recognition to Panchayati Raj Institutions and Urban Local Bodies to empower local self-government institutions. More significantly, they decreed that at least 33.33% of seats and chairperson positions were to be reserved for women. This constitutional guarantee had an immediate impact on the structure of local governance and paved the way for millions of women nationwide to become politically involved.

The most noticeable effect of these changes was the very high percentage of women in political institutions. Indian history for the first time saw women from all socio-economic backgrounds occupying elected offices in huge numbers. Gram panchayats, panchayat samitis, zila parishads, municipalities and municipal corporations were formed, which included rural women who had not been engaged in public decision making before. The Reservation Policy changed the nature of local governance, creating a more inclusive and representative system of governance through formalizing women's participation in decision-making.

The amendments also helped politically empower the women who were among the marginalised communities such as the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes. Women from historically oppressed sections of the society finally got access into political institutions which were traditionally dominated by elite groups due to reservations for women. Reservation for women was associated with reservation for other sections, which enabled the women from historically oppressed sections to access political institutional structures which were earlier dominated by elite groups. This intersectional approach helped in achieving social justice by involving and allowing the opportunities to women who suffered from multiple discriminations due to caste and gender.

Another important impact was the emergence of women leaders at the grassroots level. Women's involvement in local governance helped them to gain leadership capabilities, administrative experiences, and political consciousness. Numerous women representatives actively engaged in local concerns like drinking water supply, sanitation, healthcare, education, nutrition and welfare programs. Research carried out in different states showed that women representatives frequently focused on issues that directly impact families and communities, leading to more responsive and people-oriented government.

The amendments also questioned the traditional gender stereotypes. Traditionally politics was seen as a male dominated domain and women were expected to stay at home. Women's election into local bodies showed their ability to effectively engage in public policy-making and administration. The attitudes of the social attitude slowly changed as women took charge. Their presence in political institutions led to increased acceptance of the participation of women in public life and motivated the younger generation to aspire to leadership.

In addition, the amendments foster democratic decentralization, by getting citizens closer to governance. Women representatives played a significant role as links between local communities and government bodies. Participatory governance was enhanced by their participation, which provided an extra boost in attention to the concerns of women and vulnerable groups. In many cases the women leaders have been successful in ensuring that community is involved in development programs and social welfare activities.

The changes to the regulations have not been without its difficulties, however. In some areas 'proxy representation' developed, which meant that family men represented their female relatives who had been elected as representative(s). Yet, even in these settings, women may often have grown gradually in confidence and independence over time as a result of their

continuing involvement with the political process. Many women representatives began to play an active role in decision making over time and ceased to be symbolic.

The constitutional experiment was successful and several states later raised the number of women in their reservations from one-third to fifty percent. This enlargement further reflected the increasing sense of women's presence in governance and their representation. The amendments also served to establish a large pool of experienced women leaders and to pave the way for more women to be involved in higher levels of government.

4. Women's Reservation and Political Empowerment: a Socio-Legal Analysis

Political empowerment is the ability of individuals to be actively involved in decision making, influence public policy and exercise power in political systems. In India, reservation has been considered as a measure to empower women in politics, in response to the historical disadvantages they faced. The effectiveness of reservation should be measured not just in terms of representation but also in terms of empowerment of women in decision making, social status and leadership.

Women's reservation is based on the principle of substantive equality which is a legal basis. Formal equality means equal rights for all citizens; substantive equality means that disadvantaged groups are entitled to special measures to overcome structural inequalities. Women's reservation will create an environment where females can be given opportunities to participate in society which they may not have had, because of social and economic constraints, but will have had because of women's reservation. The reservation policy, thus, is in keeping with the constitutional mandate of social justice and inclusive democracy.

The most obvious consequence of reservation has been the greater involvement of women in political institutions. Opportunities have been provided for women who were previously disadvantaged by their exclusion from political platforms, to participate in governance and public administration. This involvement has helped them build their confidence, leadership abilities and political awareness. There are many women representatives who have said that after they were elected into public offices they became more independent and actively involved in community affairs.

The broader social implications of political empowerment through reservation have also been felt. When women hold public offices, they challenge the traditional gender roles and prove that leadership does not identify itself with gender. They are also involved in governance bodies in order to influence the society's perception on women's capacities and the normalization of a non-patriarchal attitude. Women representatives are becoming role models in many communities, motivating other women to seek education, employment and engagement in the public sphere.

Reservation is also increasing women's bargaining position in family and society. Women's participation in politics often improves their social status and their influence on family decision-making. Women leaders frequently enter into relationships with government representatives, development resources, and administrative networks, so that they can be

more effective in advocating for community needs. This increased visibility is a part of their empowerment and opens up opportunities for social mobility.

Governance is a domain in which women's participation has sometimes brought more focus to problems of the marginalised groups. It is found that women representatives are often motivated by education, healthcare, sanitation, nutrition and welfare programs. They offer perspectives through their experiences as caregivers and members of the community which enrich policy discussions and make governance institutions more responsive. Women's representation is therefore a factor of gender justice and a factor for improved public administration.

But, socio-legal analysis indicates that political empowerment is not automatic. Reservations do not automatically mean that effective participation is achieved. Current challenges for women representatives include low levels of education, training, financial reliance and social constraints. However, in some circumstances, women are unable to exercise their independence or have their say due to patriarchal norms, which reduces the transformative power of the reservation.

The situation of proxy representation is still a serious issue. Elected women representatives are likely to be influenced or controlled by male relatives in decision making. It is a practice that is detrimental to the goal of real empowerment, and it results in women's involvement becoming symbolic. In practice, however, most women become more confident and take on more decision-making power as they gain political experience.

The lack of institutional support mechanisms is another challenge. To make political participation happen, training, information, administrative support, and legal awareness need to be available. Women representatives without support may not be able to effectively carry out their duties. Capacity-building programs, therefore, are an essential component of the process of moving from a numerical representation to substantive empowerment.

Despite these difficulties, the net effect of Reservation on the empowerment of the people has been positive. The policy has opened up opportunities, raised visibility and broken powerful gender divides. It has produced a generation of women leaders, who are increasingly able to shape the governance and influence social change.

Thus, on the socio-legal side, women's reservation is an important step towards gender parity in politics. But although laws can't solve all problems, they serve as a stepping stone toward social change. There is a need for ongoing efforts to improve institutional support, education and awareness in order for the reservation to achieve its goal of true political empowerment.

5. Challenges and Issues of Women's Political Reservation

Although women's reservation has made great strides in improving political participation, a number of socio-economic, cultural and institutional factors are yet to make the implementation of the amendment a reality. Reservations have been effective in improving the number of women in local governance institutions, but the shift from descriptive to substantive representation is still a complex process. A socio-legal analysis demonstrates that

in many aspects, women remain constrained from exercising their own political authority and influence in decision making processes through structural barriers.

The most notable and stubborn problem is the high incidence of a patriarchal social structure. Gender inequalities in power have been prevalent in Indian society in the past and continue to limit women's access to public spaces. Political leadership is still a male preserve in many communities. As a result, female politicians are often faced with challenges from their families, community leaders and other politicians who doubt their capability and leadership in politics. As a result, women who enter politics often find that some family, community leaders, and political actors doubt their competence and authority as a politician. These attitudes work against the goal of reservation by fostering social environments that are disincentives for independent political participation.

Another significant challenge is the issue of proxy representation. In many instances women are elected to reserved seats but are not empowered to actually make decisions as their male relatives, often husband, father or brother, make the decisions for them. In many states, the term “Sarpanch Pati” was coined to refer to a scenario where the husband of an elected woman representative is actually controlling the governance functions. Despite constitutional provisions that give women recognition as elected officials, there are aspects of social reality which stand in their way from wielding actual decision-making authority. This is the phenomenon that brings reservation to the status of symbol than empowerment.

Educational disadvantages also are considerable barriers. Numerous women representatives, especially from rural areas, are from disadvantaged socio-economic groups, and some may have little formal education. Failure to be literate and knowledgeable about the law may cause their inability to comprehend government policies, administrative procedures, financial regulations, and development schemes. This puts them at the mercy of bureaucrats or the male members of the family and may result in loss of autonomy.

Women's political engagement is additionally complicated by economic dependence. Election campaigns, outreach and even community engagement are often costly in electoral politics. Many women have limited economic resources, and are therefore not in an advantageous position to participate in political processes. Women candidates for nomination by political parties are also deterred because of the assumption of the party members on whether they are eligible to run and able to raise funds. This means that reservation is one of the remaining means of access for women to enter the political arena.

The institutional forms of political parties are significant obstacles. Political parties in India are still male-dominated. Women are less likely to be present in party decision-making bodies and hold leadership roles. Women can be party members but not necessarily be in decision making positions. Limited intra-party reform means fewer opportunities for women to promote themselves within political parties and run for office with equal opportunity.

An additional challenge has to do with intersectional discrimination. Women from SC/ST, minority and economically weaker sections are often subjected to various forms of marginalisation. Their experiences are influenced not only by the gender but also by caste, class, religion, regional inequalities etc. Such compounded disadvantages can limit their

potential to reap the rewards of reservation policies to the fullest extent. Thus, if gender inequality is to be tackled, then other social inequalities and structural exclusions must also be taken into account.

But, institutional shortcomings do not help the effectiveness of reservation. A lot of elected women representatives are not properly trained in terms of governance, budgeting, legislative processes and administration. They might not be able to do their job well without adequate capacity-building initiatives. To be able to meaningfully engage in governance processes and exercise independent leadership, women representatives need to be supported through training and support mechanisms.

The violence and intimidation in politics cannot be ignored. Women politicians are frequently subjected to verbal abuse, character assassination, social stigma and sometimes physical threats. These menacing conditions deter women from engaging in political life and can force them to be inactive in public life. A safe and supportive political environment is thus essential for realising gender equality.

However, it is essential to note that reservation has brought about substantial change in the social landscape. There are many women who have broken through barriers to become effective leaders, administrators and policy makers. Implementing the challenges cannot be interpreted as failures, but rather as markers of the larger structural inequalities that are being addressed through reservation. To realize the transformative potential of political reservation of women, further legal reforms, social awareness, educational campaigns and institutional support are required.

6. Women's Reservation Bill: Debates, Prospects and Way Forward

The call for Reservation of seats for women in Parliament and State Legislative Assemblies is one of the most talked subjects in the Indian political discourse. In the local government, the representation of women in high level legislative bodies had remained fairly low despite the successful introduction of reservation through constitutional amendment prior to 2021. This continued underrepresentation led to the development of the Women's Reservation Bill, which sparked much debate on gender parity, representation and affirmative action in the legislative body.

The main defence of the proposed bills was to retain 1/3 of the seats reserved for women in the Lok Sabha and State Legislative Assemblages. The advocates of the Bill stated that women make up almost half of the populace and as such, they should be represented in legislative institutions in proportion to their population. They highlighted that structural barriers, social discrimination and political exclusion are responsible for excluding women from competing equally with men. Reservation was thus seen as a tool to redress the historical injustice and unleash inclusive democracy.

The positive experiences on the reservation in Panchayati Raj Institutions were also mentioned. The achievements of women representatives at the grassroots have proved that women can be effective leaders and good governors provided they are given opportunities. Reservations were supported by those who said that by expanding them to the higher

legislative houses, policy making would be enhanced and democratic legitimacy would be increased by having a greater diversity of voices and experiences in policy making.

The other reason for the Bill was to promote gender sensitive governance. Women parliamentarians tend to champion issues that have to do with education, health, social welfare, gender violence, child welfare and family welfare. Inclusion of their participation may thus result in more inclusive policy outcomes, and more focus on issues of concern to women and marginalised communities.

But the Bill also came in for a lot of criticism and opposition. One of the key issues raised was that there were no sub-quotas for women from the Other Backward Classes and some minority communities. Critics contended that reservation was not only suitable for socially and economically privileged women but also did not do enough to combat the inequalities in the category of women. They called for more protection for their varied groups to make representation fair.

Another criticism is in connection with the rotation of reserved constituencies. One opponent argued that regular turnovers might affect constituency building and undermine accountability because legislators wouldn't be able to build long-term relationships with their constituents. There was also concern that male politicians may be able to run male proxies, thus maintaining the status quo.

Some critics then went on to say that it would be better for political parties to do that instead of performing the constitutional reservation. From this view, it is better to encourage female representation in political parties by internal reform and increased commitment to gender equality rather than by quotas. But advocates of reservation argued that it was not enough for the political parties to nominate more women as candidates, legislative action was needed.

On a socio-legal angle, the issue of the Women's Reservation Bill is part of a wider conflict between formal equality and substantive equality. The equality of political rights is guaranteed by the provisions of the constitution, but with the continued differences in representation, the equality of rights is not enough to guarantee equal opportunity. The promotion of women's inclusion in governance is one of the gaps that Reservation aims to fill by establishing institutional mechanisms to enable women to participate in governance.

Building political representation for women in the coming years will depend on both legal change and social change. Leadership training, political education, financial support mechanisms, and awareness programmes to encourage women's involvement in leadership, should accompany reservation. Political parties should also institute internal reforms for achieving gender equality and provide avenues for women to take leadership.

The path forward must begin with an understanding that the inclusion of women is not only a social justice issue, it is a prerequisite for good governance for a democratic system to function. The elements of inclusive governance involve engaging with a range of voices and experiences. Greater access to legislative institutions for women can help to make governance more responsive, accountable and equitable. Thus, the issue of reservation should

be considered as a component of the overall agendas on enhancing democratic participation and substantive gender equality.

7. Conclusion

Women's reservation is one of the most important affirmative action measures in Indian democracy. It was a reaction to the constant lack of women representation in political institutions and aimed at providing women with opportunities for meaningful participation in governance. The constitution, especially the 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendments, has been a game-changer in terms of increasing the involvement of women at the grassroots and democratic decentralization. The changes allowed millions of women to enter political institutions and engage in decisions that have a direct impact on their communities.

Through the socio-legal analysis conducted in this study, we can find that women's reservations have played a significant role in the empowerment of women, leadership development and social changes. Reservation has been a way to push women into the public domain, thus challenging traditional gender stereotypes and promoting acceptance of women leadership. Women representatives have been key to tackling local development problems, enhancing public services and championing community wellbeing.

The research also seeks to identify a number of continuing obstacles to the success of reservation policies. Women's exercise of independent authority is frequently limited by the patriarchal social structures, by proxy representation, by economic dependency, by poor education and limited institutional support and by political discrimination. The issues raised show that, without a change in social attitudes and institutional practices, there cannot be substantive equality through legal changes.

The debate on Women's Reservation Bill again points to the ongoing effort of having women represented in the higher legislative chambers. There are divergent views with regard to implementation, but there is general agreement that women are under-represented in Parliament and State Legislatures. Greater involvement is crucial to improve Democratic legitimacy and inclusive governance.

REFERENCES

1. Agarwal, B. (2010). Gender and green governance: The political economy of women's presence within and beyond community forestry. Oxford University Press.
2. Ban, R., & Rao, V. (2008). Tokenism or agency? The impact of women's reservations on village democracies in South India. *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 56(3), 501–530.
3. Basu, A. (Ed.). (2005). Women's political participation and representation in India. Routledge.
4. Bhasin, K. (2004). Exploring masculinity. Women Unlimited.
5. Chattopadhyay, R., & Duflo, E. (2004). Women as policy makers: Evidence from a randomized policy experiment in India. *Econometrica*, 72(5), 1409–1443. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0262.2004.00539.x>
6. Government of India. (2007). Report of the Committee on the Empowerment of Women. Ministry of Women and Child Development.
7. Jayal, N. G. (2006). Representing India: Ethnic diversity and the governance of public institutions. Palgrave Macmillan.

8. Kaushik, S. (1993). Women and Panchayati Raj. Har-Anand Publications.
9. Kishwar, M. (1996). Women and politics: Beyond quotas. Economic and Political Weekly, 31(43), 2867–2874.
10. Nussbaum, M. C. (2000). Women and human development: The capabilities approach. Cambridge University Press.
11. Rai, S. M. (2011). Gender and the political economy of development: From nationalism to globalization (2nd ed.). Polity Press.